


City of Lee's Summit

Development Services Department

August 2, 2017

TO: City Council
FROM: Robert G. McKay, AICP, Director of Planning and Special Projects 
RE: **APPEAL HEARING – Appl. #PRERP2017-004 – Exterior Renovation Permit for Façade Improvements – 6 SW 3rd St; Shane Veritasi, applicant**

Commentary

On May 23, 2017 the Long Range Planning and Special Projects Department received an application for an Exterior Renovation Permit for the 6 SW 3rd St property. This property is located within the Downtown Core Area, as designated by the Downtown Master Development Plan, adopted as a part of the Lee's Summit Comprehensive Plan on May 10, 2005.

The applicant requests approval to replace the aluminum fascia below the transom windows and replace the stucco bulkhead with white marble.

The Lee's Summit Downtown Historic District is located within an 11.4-acre area generally located at the intersection of 3rd Street and the Missouri Pacific Railroad alignment. The irregular District's northernmost boundary is 2nd Street and its southernmost boundary is 4th Street. The western boundary is Market Street and the eastern boundary is the southeast alley between Douglas and Green Streets.

The District includes thirty-nine contributing buildings, two contributing structures, and one contributing site. With only seven non-contributing resources, 81 percent of the resources contribute to the significance of the Lee's Summit Downtown Historic District. The majority of the buildings within the District are One- and Two-Part Commercial Blocks constructed between 1880 and 1955.

The subject property, 6 SW 3rd, has had some alterations which detract from its architectural integrity. However, the building retains much of its historic significance and as part of the extant portion of the Browing Block is a contributing element in the historic district.

Recommendation

Staff recommends **Denial** of the exterior renovation permit.

Property Information

National Register of Historic Places: Lee's Summit Downtown Historic District

Proposed Use: Bar – (Hand in Glove)

Land Area: 0.02 acres (918.94 square feet)

Building Area: 735 square feet

Location: 6 SW 3rd St

Zoning: CBD (Central Business District)

Surrounding zoning and use:

North: CBD (Central Business District) — Commercial

South (across SW 3rd St): CBD (Central Business District) — The Style Room

East: CBD (Central Business District) — Wedding Expressions

West: CBD (Central Business District) — Midwest Vacuum

Date of Construction: c. 1887

Stories: 2

Structure: Load-Bearing Brick

Facade Wall: Brick

Historic Function: Commerce/Trade

Style: Late Victorian

Property Type: Two-Part Commercial Block

Historic Name: Browning Block

Storefront Type: Multiple Entry with Display Windows

Background

- 1887-88 — The building was constructed soon after the fire of 1885 as part of a multi-purpose commercial building.
- 1889-1900s — The property served as the Hulse and DeMoss Barber Shop.
- 1909 – 1920s — The property was occupied by the Charles O. Woods Bakery.
- April 19, 1988 — The City Council approved Ordinance #3137 amending the Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance to add a new section entitled “Historic Preservation Regulations and Procedures”.
- September 1, 1988 — The City of Lee’s Summit entered into a cooperative agreement with The Missouri State Historic Preservation Officer to become a Certified Local Government and agreed to follow the requirements as outlined in “Guidelines for Implementation of Certified Local Government Programs in Missouri.”
- August 17, 2005 — Lee’s Summit Downtown Historic District was added to the National Register of Historic Places.
- March 14, 2013 — The City Council approved Ordinance #7305 adopting the Downtown Design Standards for all properties within the Downtown Core Area.
- July 17, 2017 — The Lee’s Summit Historic Preservation Commission voted unanimously by voice to condemn the proposed alterations to the historic store front at 6 SW 3rd ST.

Analysis of the Exterior Renovation Permit

The design standards for the Downtown Core Area are intended to provide parameters for the physical appearance, structure and placement of buildings located in the Central Business District. The purpose of these design standards are to:

1. Promote development and redevelopment that are complementary and consistent with the character of existing structures.
2. Foster reinvestment in and redevelopment of existing structures.
3. Provide site plan and architectural standards to foster sustainable development, with an appreciation for the elements of scale and character of the historic buildings.

4. Implement the Old Lee's Summit Downtown Master Plan, a part of the Lee's Summit Comprehensive Plan, including recommendations for the Downtown Core Area.

The Commercial Core Design Standards apply to all construction within the Central Business District, including, but not limited to, new buildings, building additions, exterior alterations, and changes or additions to parking areas or driveways. The standards do not apply to interior remodeling, underground utility work, or maintenance and repair of public infrastructure.

The Design Standards require all structures exhibit the basic features of traditional buildings within the downtown area of Lee's Summit. These buildings shall align along the sidewalk edge or in relative relationship thereto consistent with traditional downtown building alignments, define the pedestrian zone and provide a sense of scale and visual interest. Strengthening this pattern of development will enhance the economic sustainability of the Downtown Core Area. The standards establish a consistent identity while accommodating individual design solutions.

Unified Development Ordinance (UDO), Article 7, Division VIII lists additional requirements that are specific to this application:

J. Building Materials and Color.

1. Exterior building materials shall be primarily brick.
2. Other building materials may be permitted, but will be limited to the rear and sides of buildings, or limited as a percentage of a façade, or only permitted as an incidental or accent material:
 - a. Traditional stucco, a cement and sand based material,
 - b. fiber cement siding (such as "HardiePlank")
 - c. new, high quality materials that are recognized by an approved third party testing agency which meet or exceed the quality of the materials listed
 - d. Innovative or "green" materials, provided they appear similar in quality, texture, finish and dimension to permitted materials and which are recognized by an approved third party testing agency which meet or exceed the quality of the materials listed.
 - e. Architectural metal or historic metal to match existing building.
3. Prohibited materials shall include:
 - a. Metal siding and corrugated metal. Existing buildings with metal siding on the rear and sides may be maintained and repaired with similar materials.
 - b. Exterior Finish Insulation Systems (EFIS), a lightweight synthetic wall cladding that includes foam plastic insulation and thin synthetic coatings; except as a trim, accent, cornice or profile material.
 - c. Mirror glass which reflects more than 40 percent of incident visible light.
4. Simple material finishes are encouraged.
5. Matte finishes are preferred.
6. Building colors.
 - a. Building colors should be in traditional brick colors.
 - b. Accent colors should be selected to compliment and contrast the primary brick color.

- c. Colors should evoke a sense of richness and liveliness to complement and support the overall character of Downtown Lee's Summit.
- d. Existing unpainted brick shall not be painted.

Staff Analysis

The storefronts of Downtown Lee's Summit are part of the character-defining elements in the district and should retain as much historic fabric as possible. The consistency and repetition of these building materials form a cohesive environment. A building that breaks this pattern tends to look out of place and disrupts the coherency of the streetscape.

Lee's Summit's Downtown historic commercial buildings are typically brick with metal, wood or masonry trim. The color palettes for these buildings are that of traditional brick colors with accent colors that complement and contrast the primary brick color. For Lee's Summit's historic commercial buildings, windows and trim were usually painted with darker colors than the main body of the building.

The storefront is one of the most important architectural features of the historic commercial buildings in Lee's Summit. With that being said, storefronts are the feature most commonly altered. In the process, these alterations can completely change or destroy a building's distinguishing architectural features. This causes the loss of what makes up the historic character of the district. The purpose of the Downtown Lee's Summit Design Guidelines is to protect the integrity and character of our community.

Additionally, if left unchecked the continued erosion of the architectural integrity of the district can have the profound consequence of causing the Lee's Summit Downtown Historic District being removed from the National Register of Historic Places. Removal from the National Register eliminates access to Federal and State tax credits for future development projects.

The Downtown Design Guidelines require the materials used in a project exhibit the basic features of traditional buildings within the district. Additionally, the guidelines require all materials to complement and support the overall character of Downtown Lee's Summit. In the context of Lee's Summit Historic Downtown, the proposed white marble is not a material that was historically used nor can it be currently found in other applications within the district.

For these reasons, staff does not feel that the Exterior Renovation as proposed is consistent with the requirements the district Design Standards.

RGM/csm

Attachments:

1. Exterior Renovation Permit Application, dated June 8, 2017– 4 pages
2. Staff Letter to Applicant, dated July 3, 2017– 4 pages
3. Missouri Historic Resources Survey Form, dated October 2001 – 5 pages
4. National Register of Historic Places Registration Form, Lee's Summit Downtown Historic District, dated June 30, 2005– 82 pages
5. Certified Local Government Agreement, Dated September 1, 1988 – 3 pages
6. Sketchup Rendering of Applicant's Proposed Exterior Renovation – 1 page
7. Sketchup Rendering of Staff's Recommendation for Exterior Renovation – 1 page
8. Current Photo of 6 SW 3rd St – 1 page
9. Location Map